

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

In the Matter of Hamid Saleem, Sanitation Superintendent (PM5106C), Newark

CSC Docket No. 2023-174

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Examination Appeal

ISSUED: November 2, 2022 (RE)

Hamid Saleem appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that he did not meet the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Sanitation Superintendent (PM5106C), Newark.

:

The subject examination had a closing date of December 21, 2021 and was open, in pertinent part, to employees in the competitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and who possessed five years of experience in work involving the collection and disposal of refuse, three years of which shall have been in a supervisory capacity. The appellant was found to be below the minimum requirements in experience. There are five candidates on the eligible list, which has not yet been certified.

The appellant listed one position on his application, Sanitation Superintendent from July 1998 to December 2021. Official records indicate that the appellant was a provisional Sanitation Superintendent from May 2021 to the closing date, Supervisor Demolition from September 2007 to May 2021, and Laborer 1 from June 1999 to September 2007. As he did not indicate that he was collecting and disposing of refuse as duties in the one position on his application, this was not accepted, and he was found to be lacking five years of applicable experience.

On appeal, the appellant argues that he has the applicable experience as he has been a Sanitation Supervisor for 15 years. He provided a resume states that he is a "Supervisor" from April 1997 to December 2021.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.3(b) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open competitive examination announcement by the closing date. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.1(f) provides that an applicant may amend a previously submitted application prior to the closing date.

Initially, it is noted that eligibility for a given examination is determined based on the information provided on the application. The application states, "You may be declared ineligible or you may not receive proper credit for scoring purposes if you do not properly complete your application," and "Since your application may be your only 'test paper,' be sure it is complete and accurate. Failure to complete your application properly may cause you to be declared ineligible, lower your score, or possibly cause you to fail." The published announcement also clearly specifies the relevant time frames for filing and amending applications. Also, for experience to be acceptable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. The amount of time, and the importance of the duty, determines if it is the primary focus. See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi (MSB, decided June 9, 2004).

On his application, the appellant did not indicate the required experience in the position listed on his application. The application is not a formality used to schedule examinations as this agency makes official determinations for eligibility for all prospective candidates for position in State or local Civil Service jurisdictions since only those applicants who meet the minimum eligibility requirements are then evaluated through the testing process in order to determine relative merit and fitness. See In the Matter of Daniel Roach (MSB, decided October 20, 2004). Thus, the application is utilized to screen the candidate pool to ensure that applicants meet the minimum experience requirements for each position. Provisional appointees are not exempt from this screening process. Those applicants who meet the minimum eligibility requirements are then evaluated through the testing process in order to determine their relative merit and fitness. experience on the one position on the application were to be accepted, the appellant would have been credited with seven months of general and supervisory experience, the period of time he was in his provisional position, and he would be lacking four years, five months of required experience. On appeal, the appellant provides a resume that is similar as it lists his provisional title for his entire employment. The appellant did not properly complete his application, and as the list is complete with five eligible candidates, experience in supplemental positions cannot be accepted. Moreover, any applicable supervisory duties he may have performed as a Supervisor Demolition or as a Laborer 1 would have been considered out-or-title as the primary focus of a Supervisor Demolition is not in the collection and disposal of refuse and Laborer 1 is not a supervisory title. Such out-of-title experience is generally not acceptable for promotional examinations absent specific verification from the appointing authority and the absence of a complete list. Neither circumstance is present in this matter. Finally, the appellant is cautioned to properly complete any future applications by listing each position separately with the duties of the titles properly described.

The appellant was denied admittance to the subject examination since he lacked the minimum requirements in experience. An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of Agency Services, that the appellant does not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date, is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Thus, the appellant has failed to support his burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 2^{ND} DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2022

Devrare' L. Webster Calib

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and

Correspondence

Nicholas F. Angiulo

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit

P. O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Hamid Saleem Tiffany Stewart Division of Agency Services Records Center